

February 5, 2008

EDMOND PLANNING COMMISSION MEETING

Tuesday, February 5, 2008

5:30 P.M.

The Edmond Planning Commission Meeting was called to order by Chairperson Suzy Thrash at 5:30 p.m., Tuesday, May 22, 2007, in the City Council Chambers at 20 South Littler. Other members present were Bill Moyer, Leroy Cartwright, Barry K. Moore and Ingrid Young. Present for the City were Robert L. Schiermeyer, City Planner; Kristi McCone, City Planner; Jan Ramseyer-Fees, City Planner; Steve Manek, City Engineer; and Steve Murdock, City Attorney. The first item on the agenda was the approval of the January 22, 2008 Planning Commission minutes.

Motion by Cartwright, seconded by Moore, to approve the minutes as written. **Motion carried** by a vote of 5-0 as follows:

AYES: Members: Cartwright, Moore, Moyer, Young and Chairperson Thrash
NAYS: None

The next item on the agenda was: Case #Z080004 Public Hearing and Consideration of Edmond Plan Amendment from Educational/Institutional to General Commercial for a 1,546 square feet area for a cellular communication tower, generally located immediately north of the YMCA building, east of Rankin. (T-Mobile)

The following general planning considerations represent some of the factors evaluated in reviewing justifications for Plan Map Amendments.

1. Infrastructure: Electricity is needed for this use, and that is available adjacent to the property. No water or sewer services are needed for this use.
2. Traffic: There are currently no traffic counts on Rankin and, even with the traffic generators of the middle school and YMCA, Rankin is still within a standard collector street volume of traffic. Rankin is also on one of the local bus routes, operated through the City and COPTA.
3. Existing zoning pattern:
North – Edmond school
South – Educational/Institutional, YMCA
East – “A” Single Family and “C-2” Multi-Family
West – “A” Single Family
4. Land Use:
North – School usage, tennis courts, former administration building
South – Educational/Institutional YMCA
East – Single Family and Multi-Family

February 5, 2008

West – Single Family

5. Density: N/A
6. Land ownership pattern:
North –Edmond school district, approximately 15 acres, Central Middle School
East – Residential lots and multi-family lots
South – YMCA, extending south to Mary Lee Lane
West – Residential lots fronting on Rankin
7. Physical features: The land is already improved as part of the YMCA yard. The property is in a “built” environment.
8. Special conditions: See site plan comments below.
9. Location of Schools and School Land: Central Middle School and recreational facilities.
10. Compatibility to Edmond Plan: The YMCA is an institutional type usage, as identified on the Edmond Plan. The buildings on the site and the parking provide for substantially different characteristics than the “lowest intensity” usage of standard single family dwellings; however, the YMCA is zoned as single family. In the past, additions were approved with Special Use Permits in a single family. The method available for T-Mobile to request a cell tower site is to rezone a small parcel of land on the YMCA site for the cell tower. The access would be to Rankin, and is not considered part of the “E-1” zoning requirement. In the past, oil wells were reviewed with Special Use Permits in a similar manner. T-Mobile is leasing just the 1,546.11 square feet needed for the tower.
11. Site Plan Review: The following standards apply to cell towers on “E-1” General Commercial property:
 - (a) **Height**

No free-standing tower shall exceed 130 feet in height, unless approved with a specific use permit as height variance when requested in an applicable district. In no event shall any tower exceed 180 feet in height.
 - (b) **Yards**
 - i. The towers shall be setback from the property line in all directions a distance at least the height of the tower where the tower adjoins a residential district;

February 5, 2008

- ii. The tower shall be setback from the property line in all directions the distance required in the underlying district.

(c) Other Design Standards

- i. All freestanding towers shall be designed to accommodate at least three, two-way antennas for every 130 feet of tower height. The above requirements may be modified to provide the maximum number of compatible users within the radio frequency emission levels.
- ii. With the exception of necessary electric and telephone service and connection lines approved by the City, no part of any tower or antenna, nor any lines, cable, equipment, wires or braces in connection with either, shall at any time extend across or over any part of the public right-of-way, sidewalk utility easement or property line.
- iii. Towers shall be of a monopole design. The use of guyed or lattice towers is prohibited.
- iv. Every freestanding tower shall be protected from trespassers in order to discourage the climbing of the tower by unauthorized persons.
- v. Towers shall be constructed so that if a failure does occur, the tower will collapse onto itself and will not fall onto structures near the site.
- vi. Mobile or immobile equipment not used in direct support of a tower facility shall not be stored or parked on the site, unless repairs to the tower or antenna are being made.
- vii. No tower shall have a platform, crow's nest or like structure around it, or attached to it, except while under construction or repair.
- viii. Lighting of the accessory buildings for basic security purposes is permissible but may not result in unnecessary glare on adjacent properties.
- ix. All accessory buildings or structures shall meet all building design standards as listed in this Chapter, shall require a building permit issued by the Building Department and shall conform with the height restrictions and yards established for the site's district. All buildings, structures and equipment accessory to a tower or antenna shall be designed to blend in with the surrounding environment through the use of color, camouflage and architecture. If located in or adjoining residential district, the tower shall be surrounded by a landscaped buffer.

February 5, 2008

Any tower constructed in the "E-1" District would be required to meet the above standards. T-Mobile is planning for this location to be an alternate to the site they originally started with prior to the new zoning ordinance, west of Edgewood Drive on the south side of 15th Street. Residents protested the cell tower site on 15th Street, and suggested that other locations be considered on a larger parcel, such as the school site.

The staff noted that until the land was actually zoned "E-1" General Commercial; no Specific Use Permit could be considered. The applicant needed to understand that he could not request the 150 foot tower until the "E-1" zoning was considered and approved. The maximum tower height in the "E-1" General Commercial District is 130 feet. Specific Use Permits could be considered if the zoning is in place.

George Wyrick, with T-Mobile, indicated that the original site on 15th Street was selected to fill a gap in the service radius needed for the cell tower coverage. Other locations were suggested to be considered and this site by the YMCA can improve the service needed for this area. Persons using T-Mobile have signed letters or petitions indicating they would like to see a new tower to improve coverage in this location. Mr. Wyrick submitted land appraisals indicating that cell towers do not adversely affect the property values. Planning Commissioner Ingrid Young asked how the tower collapses on itself. Farley Duvall, with T-Mobile, indicated that the joints or sections of the tower are engineered to weaken and collapse in the event of an extraordinary event, such as extreme winds, fire surrounding the property causing high heat conditions, or any other exceptional events. The tower is not designed to be a rigid structure, where it would fall. Jamin Yeager, 1216 Mary Lee Lane, objected to the cell tower. He indicated that this is a residential environment and that most of the electrical lines are buried. He demonstrated, with maps, how many residents were within 300 feet from the tower. He sited a study that the towers are recommended to be 300 meters from any residence. He indicated that the tower was right against the YMCA building, which they may have a concern about for health reasons. Mr. Yeager indicated another map demonstrating other locations possible, where homes would be further away from the cell tower. David Frank, with Verizon, indicated he supported the cell tower and planned to co-locate on the tower. He indicated that it was difficult area to cover for cell service. Pam Hibbs, 512 Mary Lee Lane, indicated that she objected to the cell tower in this residential area. She felt that the school and the YMCA have become part of the residential neighborhood and the tower was not appropriate for this type of addition. Barry K. Moore asked if they had considered continuing the item to talk with the neighbors, as requested by the letter received by the Commission. Mr. Wyrick indicated that he would like to proceed, since they have been working on this site for some time, as an alternate to the 15th Street site.

Motion by Cartwright, seconded by Moyer, to approve this request. **Motion was denied** by a vote of 4-1 as follows:

AYES: Member: Cartwright

February 5, 2008

NAYS: Members: Moyer, Young, Moore and Chairperson Thrash

The next item on the agenda was: Case #Z080005 Public Hearing and Consideration of Rezoning from “A” Single Family Dwelling District to “E-1” General Commercial District for a cellular communication tower, generally located immediately north of the YMCA building, east of Rankin. (T-Mobile)

George Wyrick with T-Mobile is requesting one cell tower location north of the YMCA building on South Rankin. The Edmond School District owns land to the north, where the previous administration building was located and now a series of tennis courts have been constructed east of the building. The development to the east includes the Brentwood Townhouses and to the northeast is the Brentwood Single Family Addition. T-Mobile would prefer to have a 150 feet tall tower to facilitate future co-located antennas, as well as other grid considerations. The Municipal Code provides for a maximum 130 feet, although a taller tower may be applicable through a Special Use Permit. The subject property is not even zoned “E-1” at this time, so the Special Use Permit approach could not be considered until the land is zoned “E-1”, which is the minimum zoning district for a cell tower.

T-Mobile is requesting only 1,546.11 square feet of land, immediately north of the YMCA building. This location is to maintain as much separation to the east as possible, where the nearest homes are located. The access will be from Rankin. The area will be fenced, as required, and there will be an equipment building as standard with the cell tower sites. The cell tower will not be 150 feet or 130 feet away from the north property line of the YMCA ownership. The Edmond School District is familiar with this request. Mr. Wyrick indicates that they have no objection, even though the tower is near the property line. The site location serves to screen the base of the tower with the equipment building and fenced in enclosure. If a location was chosen further away from the north property line, the view of the tower, including the base equipment building and fenced in enclosure, would be more easily observed from Rankin. The tower location selected is approximately 291 feet to the east property line and 350 feet to the west property line to the YMCA parcel.

Motion by Moore, seconded by Cartwright, to approve this request. **Motion was denied** by a vote of 4-1 as follows:

AYES: Member: Cartwright

NAYS: Members: Moore, Moyer, Young and Chairperson Thrash

Case #Z080003 Public Hearing and Consideration of Rezoning from “R-2” Urban Estate Dwelling District to “A” Single Family Dwelling District on property generally located south of Covell Road, ½ mile west of Douglas. (Covell Development, LLC)

February 5, 2008

Motion by Moyer, seconded by Cartwright, to continue item to February 19, 2008.

Motion carried by a vote of 4-0 as follows:

AYES: Members: Moyer, Cartwright, Moore, Young and Chairperson Thrash

NAYS: None

The next item on the agenda was: Case #Z080001 Public Hearing and Consideration of Rezoning from “G-A” General Agriculture to “R-1” Rural Estate Dwelling located at 5604 Indian Hill Road, north of 2nd Street, west of Air Depot. (Emett Clark)

Mr. Clark is requesting the rezoning of 5-acres of his property located at 5604 Indian Hill Road, from “G-A” General Agricultural to “R-1” Rural Estate District. This will allow for another home site on the property as “R-1” requires 90,000 square feet per lot as opposed the 5-acres the “G-A” district requires. There is currently one house on half of the subject 5-acre tract. The property to the north is zoned “R-1”; properties to the south, east and west are zoned “G-A”. Several properties in the area have been rezoned to “R-1” within the last 15 years and this zoning change would be consistent with what has happened around the subject property. This area is projected for Single Family on the Edmond Plan IV and does not require a plan amendment.

Mr. Clark was in attendance, representing the applicant.

Motion by Moore, seconded by Moyer, to approve this request. **Motion carried** by a vote of 5-0 as follows:

AYES: Members: Moore, Moyer, Cartwright, Young and Chairperson Thrash

NAYS: None

Motion by Cartwright, seconded by Moore, to adjourn. **Motion carried** by a vote of 5-0 as follows:

AYES: Members: Cartwright, Moore, Moyer, Young and Chairperson Thrash

NAYS: None

Meeting adjourned at 6:00 p.m.

Suzy Thrash, Chairperson
Edmond Planning Commission

Robert Schiermeyer, Secretary
Edmond Planning Commission